

# Higher criticism

## SECTION 2 – Critical Essay

### Supplementary marking grid

	Marks 20-18	Marks 18-16	Marks 15-13	Marks 12-10	Marks 9-6	Marks 5-1	Marks 0
<b>Knowledge and understanding</b> The critical essay demonstrates:	a comprehensive knowledge and understanding of the text	a very clear knowledge and understanding of the text	a clear knowledge and understanding of the text	an adequate knowledge and understanding of the text	limited evidence of knowledge and understanding of the text	little knowledge and understanding of the text	no knowledge of the text and its central concerns
	a comprehensive selection of textual evidence to support a relevant and coherent argument	very clear textual evidence to support an argument which is clearly focused on the demands of the question	clear textual evidence to support the demands of the question	adequate textual evidence to support a line of thought which has some focus on the question	limited textual evidence to support focus on the demands of the question	little textual evidence to support focus on the demands of the question	no attempt to answer the question and no textual evidence
<b>Analysis</b> The critical essay demonstrates:	a comprehensive analysis of the effect of features of language/lyric techniques	a very clear analysis of the effect of features of language/lyric techniques	a clear analysis of the effect of features of language/lyric techniques	an adequate analysis of the effect of features of language/lyric techniques	limited analysis of the effect of features of language/lyric techniques	little analysis of features of language/lyric techniques	no analysis of features of language/lyric techniques
<b>Evaluation</b> The critical essay demonstrates:	a committed, very clear evaluative stance with respect to the text and the task	a very clear evaluative stance with respect to the text and the task	a clear evaluative stance with respect to the text and the task	adequate evidence of an evaluative stance with respect to the text and the task	limited evidence of an evaluative stance with respect to the text and the task	little evidence of an evaluative stance with respect to the text and the task	no evidence of evaluation
<b>Technical Accuracy</b> The critical essay demonstrates:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>few errors in spelling, grammar, sentence construction, punctuation and paragraphing</li> <li>the ability to be understood at first reading</li> </ul>				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>errors in spelling, grammar, sentence construction, punctuation and paragraphing which impede understanding</li> </ul>		

### Introductions

#### You need to improve your introduction:

- to give more of a complete overview of the text
- to link the overview more carefully to the task
- to make some personal response/evaluation fuller and more relevant to the task.

### Main Paragraphs (SQUAT)

#### The openings of your paragraphs need ('S' from SQUAT):

- clearer expression of the point you want to make in relation to the task
- more context for your reader; more summary of what leads up to your quote
- occasional links back to ideas you've just mentioned at the ends of previous paragraphs.

#### The middles of paragraphs need to ('QUA' from SQUAT):

##### Content

- Develop points more fully
- Show better knowledge and understanding of text as a whole
- If appropriate to task, deal with the text 'chronologically' – don't pick quotes at random or 'jump about'
- Link points together more effectively
- Improve structure of essay as a whole

##### Quotation

- Use more!
- Introduce them properly
- Quote accurately
- Include long as well as short quotation
- Make sure the quotes prove point effectively

##### Analysis

- Analyse quotation fully
- Make sure analysis is relevant to task
- Show awareness of language/literary techniques
- realise that points made need to include 'broad reading' analysis (eg of plot/structure; characterisation; theme; turning points, irony, symbolism etc)
- make sure your analysis does more than identify techniques – it needs to explain effect and impact

### The ends of paragraphs need to ('T' from SQUAT):

- link the analysis and evaluation carefully to the task, the question you're answering
- ensure the evaluative statements go further than "I really enjoyed" – they can be threaded through in a subtle way

### Conclusions

#### You need to improve your conclusion:

- because it's nothing more than a summary of what you've examined in the essay
- to link your analysis of the ending of the text (or the last thing you examined) to your final overall answer to the question, to what you finally feel about the text (or the bits of it relevant to the question)
- to say more about the themes, about what the text has 'taught' you
- to give a fuller response to the task.

### Expression

- You need to improve your:** sentence structure/spelling/punctuation/vocabulary

### Additional Comments:

# Higher Discursive

## Writing which is broadly discursive

Range of marks	Marks 15-13	Marks 12-10	Marks 9-7	Marks 6-4	Marks 3-1	Marks 0
<b>Content</b> The discursive essay demonstrates, as appropriate to genre:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>committed attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>full understanding and engagement</li> <li>evidence of full research and selection, as appropriate</li> <li>a clear and sustained line of thought/convincing stance</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>clear attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>clear understanding and engagement</li> <li>evidence of careful research and selection, as appropriate</li> <li>a clear line of thought/clear, engaged stance</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>adequate attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>adequate understanding</li> <li>evidence of relevant research and selection, as appropriate</li> <li>a line of thought/clear stance</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>limited attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>limited understanding</li> <li>evidence of limited relevant research, as appropriate</li> <li>an unclear line of thought</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>little attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>little understanding</li> <li>little evidence of research</li> <li>a confused line of thought</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>no evidence of the skills required in terms of content, style and accuracy</li> </ul>
<b>Style</b> The discursive essay demonstrates, as appropriate to genre:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>linguistic features of the chosen genre used comprehensively to argue/discuss/persuade and convey depth and complexity of thought/objectivity/insight/persuasive force</li> <li>confident and varied expression</li> <li>an effective structure which enhances the purpose/meaning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>linguistic features of the chosen genre used clearly to argue/discuss/persuade and convey thought/objectivity/insight/persuasive force</li> <li>confident expression</li> <li>a structure which enhances the purpose/meaning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>linguistic features of the chosen genre used adequately to argue/discuss/persuade and convey thought/objectivity/insight/persuasive force</li> <li>adequate expression</li> <li>an adequate structure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>linguistic features of the chosen genre used in a limited way to argue/discuss/persuade and convey thought/objectivity/insight/persuasive force</li> <li>limited expression</li> <li>a limited use of structure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>no attempt at using language effectively</li> <li>many errors in punctuation/syntax/spelling</li> <li>little use of structure</li> </ul>	

### Discursive writing – areas for improvement

- Are you clear about your purpose? Be sure about what your piece of writing is trying to do. Make sure your line of thought is absolutely consistent.
- Your introduction needs work – think of getting the reader's attention; introducing the topic in an interesting, entertaining way; defining the problem or issue and outlining different attitudes to it; hinting at your view/attitude if appropriate.
- Make sure your tone is appropriate to the purpose – be clear about formal and informal language and when they can be used.
- Linking/contrasting/topic sentences need work; work at balancing contrasting arguments or work at outlining an opposing argument and demolishing it.
- Consider use of humour, mockery, exaggeration, comparisons, anecdote, irony as appropriate to your purpose.
- You have a tendency to 'over-write' – tone down the language a little; use simpler, clearer language.
- Be careful how you use statistics or experts' views or quotations – make sure they help you meet your purpose.
- You seem to have no evidence to back up your arguments – statistics? Research?
- Work on your conclusion – think about echoing something mentioned earlier and/or building to a climax and/or making policy change recommendations to various groups.
- Your expression/grammar/sentence structure/spelling needs to be improved – YOU need to go through the piece and try to spot the errors!
- Cite your sources fully and accurately in line with guidelines.

Other comments:



# Higher Personal/reflective

## Writing which is broadly creative

Range of marks	Marks 15-13	Marks 12-10	Marks 9-7	Marks 6-4	Marks 3-1	Marks 0
<b>Content</b> The creative piece demonstrates, as appropriate to genre:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>committed attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>strong creative qualities</li> <li>evident command of the genre</li> <li>thematic concerns which are clearly introduced and developed</li> <li>ideas/feelings/experiences which are explored with a strong degree of mature reflection/self-awareness/ involvement/ insight/sensitivity</li> <li>the writer's personality and individuality</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>clear attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>clear creative qualities</li> <li>insight into the genre</li> <li>thematic concerns which are introduced and developed</li> <li>ideas/feelings/experiences are explored with a clear sense of reflection/self-awareness/ involvement/ insight/ sensitivity</li> <li>the writer's personality clearly</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>adequate attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>adequate creative qualities</li> <li>understanding of the genre</li> <li>thematic concerns which are introduced</li> <li>ideas/feelings/experiences which are explored with an adequate sense of reflection and involvement</li> <li>the writer's personality</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>limited attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>limited creative qualities</li> <li>a limited use of conventions of genre</li> <li>limited thematic concerns</li> <li>limited ideas/feelings/experiences explored</li> <li>limited sense of the writer's personality</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>little attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>few creative qualities</li> <li>little use of conventions of genre</li> <li>little thematic concerns</li> <li>little evidence of exploration of ideas or feelings</li> <li>little sense of the writer's personality</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>no evidence of the skills required in terms of content, style and accuracy</li> </ul>
<b>Style</b> The creative piece demonstrates, as appropriate to genre:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>linguistic features of the chosen genre used skilfully to create a strong impact</li> <li>confident and varied expression</li> <li>an effective structure which enhances the purpose/meaning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>linguistic features of the chosen genre used successfully to create impact</li> <li>confident expression</li> <li>a clear structure which enhances the purpose/meaning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>linguistic features of the chosen genre used successfully</li> <li>adequate expression</li> <li>an adequate structure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>limited linguistic features of the chosen genre</li> <li>limited expression</li> <li>a limited use of structure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>no attempt at using language effectively</li> <li>many errors in punctuation/syntax/spelling</li> <li>little use of structure</li> </ul>	

Higher English portfolio: assessment task

4

### Personal/Reflective Writing – Areas for Improvement

#### Teacher's Feedback

- Think carefully about content and structure – personal writing at this level should be more than simply description of an experience, with a bit of reflection tacked on at the end; there should be reflection throughout the piece.
- Remind yourself about what 'reflection' actually means e.g. think of what you have learned or gained from the experience; consider what you appreciate now that you didn't before; explain the new insights you have about yourself and/or others. Revise the handout sheet on reflection.
- Your personality and individuality need to come across more strongly – how should you achieve this? Look back over several examples of successful pieces to get some ideas.
- Your language, word choice, imagery are a little dull/mundane/clichéd – how can you 'spice' it up a bit?
- Your sentence structure should be more varied.
- Your expression/grammar/sentence structure/spelling needs to be improved – YOU need to go through the piece and try to spot the errors!

#### Stylistic and Technical Issues

- work on the way you present and describe people; re-read p80-85 in Writing to 14
- work on the way you describe setting; re-read p86-9 in Writing to 14
- work on building tension at key moments; re-read p106-7 in Writing to 14
- work on conventions of dialogue; don't use dialogue too much! Re-read p84-5.
- watch your tenses; re-read p108-9 in Writing to 14
- try to vary your sentences; re-read p110-111 in Writing to 14
- choose the right vocabulary; re-read p112-3 in Writing to 14
- use more descriptive and poetic language; re-read p114-5 in Writing to 14
- watch your accuracy with sentence structure and punctuation; read p67-75

# Higher Imaginative

## Writing which is broadly creative

Range of marks	Marks 15-13	Marks 12-10	Marks 9-7	Marks 6-4	Marks 3-1	Marks 0
<b>Content</b> The creative piece demonstrates, as appropriate to genre:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ committed attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>♦ strong creative qualities</li> <li>♦ evident command of the genre</li> <li>♦ thematic concerns which are clearly introduced and developed</li> <li>♦ ideas/feelings/experiences which are explored with a strong degree of mature reflection/self-awareness/involvement/insight/sensitivity</li> <li>♦ the writer's personality and individuality</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ clear attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>♦ clear creative qualities</li> <li>♦ insight into the genre</li> <li>♦ thematic concerns which are introduced and developed</li> <li>♦ ideas/feelings/experiences are explored with a clear sense of reflection/self-awareness/involvement/insight/sensitivity</li> <li>♦ the writer's personality clearly</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ adequate attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>♦ adequate creative qualities</li> <li>♦ understanding of the genre</li> <li>♦ thematic concerns which are introduced</li> <li>♦ ideas/feelings/experiences which are explored with an adequate sense of reflection and involvement</li> <li>♦ the writer's personality</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ limited attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>♦ limited creative qualities</li> <li>♦ a limited use of conventions of genre</li> <li>♦ limited thematic concerns</li> <li>♦ limited ideas/feelings/experiences explored</li> <li>♦ limited sense of the writer's personality</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ little attention to purpose and audience</li> <li>♦ few creative qualities</li> <li>♦ little use of conventions of genre</li> <li>♦ little thematic concerns</li> <li>♦ little evidence of exploration of ideas or feelings</li> <li>♦ little sense of the writer's personality</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ no evidence of the skills required in terms of content, style and accuracy</li> </ul>
<b>Style</b> The creative piece demonstrates, as appropriate to genre:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ linguistic features of the chosen genre used skilfully to create a strong impact</li> <li>♦ confident and varied expression</li> <li>♦ an effective structure which enhances the purpose/meaning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ linguistic features of the chosen genre used successfully to create impact</li> <li>♦ confident expression</li> <li>♦ a clear structure which enhances the purpose/meaning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ linguistic features of the chosen genre used successfully</li> <li>♦ adequate expression</li> <li>♦ an adequate structure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ limited linguistic features of the chosen genre</li> <li>♦ limited expression</li> <li>♦ a limited use of structure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ no attempt at using language effectively</li> <li>♦ many errors in punctuation/syntax/spelling</li> <li>♦ little use of structure</li> </ul>	

Higher English portfolio: assessment task

4

### Imaginative Writing – Areas for Improvement

#### Teacher's Feedback

##### Structural and Genre Awareness Issues

- work on your opening; re-read p102-3 and 86-7 in Writing to 14
- work on endings; re-read p104-5 in Writing to 14
- show, don't tell; re-read p78-9 in Writing to 14
- present your characters in a fresher way; re-read p80-85 in Writing to 14
- fit your characters more carefully into realistic settings; re-read p88-9 in Writing to 14
- work on your use of time and/or your narrative point of view; re-read p94-101 in Writing to 14
- work on building tension in key scenes; re-read p106-7 in Writing to 14
- work on conventions of dialogue; don't use dialogue too much!

##### Stylistic and Technical Issues

- watch your tenses' re-read p108-9 in Writing to 14
  - try to vary your sentences; re-read p110-111 in Writing to 14
  - choose the right vocabulary; re-read p112-3 in Writing to 14
  - use more descriptive and poetic language; re-read p114-5 in Writing to 14
  - watch your accuracy with sentence structure and punctuation; read -67-75
- your expression/grammar/sentence structure/spelling needs to be improved – YOU need to go through the piece and try to spot the errors!

Any other comments .....

